

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
EASTERN DISTRICT OF NORTH CAROLINA  
WESTERN DIVISION**

SUSAN JANE HOGARTH,

*Plaintiff,*

v.

SAM HAYES, et al.,

*Defendants.*

Case No.: 5:24-cv-00481

Hon. Louise W. Flanagan

**PLAINTIFF'S MOTION FOR  
JUDGMENT ON THE PLEADINGS**

Plaintiff Susan Hogarth respectfully moves for judgment on the pleadings under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 12(c). As explained in Hogarth's memorandum in support of this motion, N.C. Gen. Stat. §§ 163-166.3(c), 163-273(a)(1), 163-165.1(e), 163-274(b)(1), and 163-166.3(b) violate the First Amendment as applied to ballot selfies—voters' photos with or of their own voted ballots.

Hogarth respectfully requests the Court grant her judgment on the pleadings and permanently enjoin the Defendants from enforcing North Carolina's ban on ballot selfies.

Dated: July 11, 2025

Respectfully Submitted,

/s/ James M. Dedman IV

James M. Dedman IV\*

(NC Bar # 37415)

Gallivan White & Boyd P.A.

6805 Carnegie Blvd, Ste. 200

Charlotte, NC, 28211

(704)-552-1712

[jdeman@gwblawfirm.com](mailto:jdeman@gwblawfirm.com)

Eric Spengler\*

(NC Bar # 47165)

SPENGLER + AGANS PLLC

/s/ Jeffrey D. Zeman

JEFFREY D. ZEMAN\*\*

(Penn. Bar No. 328570)

FOUNDATION FOR INDIVIDUAL

RIGHTS AND EXPRESSION

510 Walnut St., Ste. 900

Philadelphia, PA 19106

(215) 717-3473

[jeff.zeman@thefire.org](mailto:jeff.zeman@thefire.org)

DANIEL A. ZAHN\*\*

(DC Bar No. 90027403)

352 N. Caswell Rd.  
Charlotte, NC 28204  
(704) 999-8733  
eric@sab.law

\*Local Civil Rule 83.1(d) Attorney

FOUNDATION FOR INDIVIDUAL  
RIGHTS AND EXPRESSION  
700 Pennsylvania Ave. SE, Ste. 340  
Washington, DC 20003  
(215) 717-3473  
daniel.zahn@thefire.org

\*\*Special Appearance Pursuant to  
Local Rule 83.1(e)

*Attorneys for Plaintiff*

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I, Jeffrey D. Zeman, hereby certify that on July 11, 2025, I submitted the foregoing to the Clerk of the Court via the District Court's CM/ECF system.

/s/ Jeffrey D. Zeman  
JEFFREY D. ZEMAN  
FOUNDATION FOR INDIVIDUAL  
RIGHTS AND EXPRESSION